## Measuring informal employment in urban China

Wu Yaowu, Du Yang, and Albert Park

Institute of Population and Labor Economics CASS

### Background

- Accompanying with economic transition, informal employment appeared in urban China.
- In the period of aggressive state owned enterprise reform, 1998-2002, about 60 million workers were laid-off and majority of them reemployed in informal sector.
- Accompanying with high economic growth, the employment pressure has been alleviated since 2004.
- Labor Contract Law was enacted in 2008, Chinese government began to formalize the labor market.
- The purpose of my research is to provide a statistical definition on measuring informal employment in urban China.

### Statistical definition on informal employment proposed by ILO

- In the International Labor Conference 90<sup>th</sup> Session(2002 June), ILO proposed a job based definition on informal employment.
- The concept of informal sector is still an important dimension in policy-making.
- The standard (of the informal employment)
  has been accepted by majority of scholars
  and governments of developing countries.

### The conceptual framework for informal economy proposed by ILO

Product ion	Jobs by status in employment									
units by type	Own-account workers		Empl	oyers	Contribu ting family workers	Emplo	oyees	Memb produ cooper	cers'	
	Informal	Formal	Informal	Formal	Informal	Informal	Formal	Informal	Formal	
Formal sector enterprise s					1	2				
Informal sector enterprise s(a)	3		4		5	6	7	8		
Househol ds(b)	9					10				

#### 2. Data and definitions

- The third round Chinese Urban Labor Market Survey( CULS3).
- 6 cities: Shanghai, Wuhan, Shenyang, Fuzhou, Xi-an, Guangzhou.
- Local residents: 700 households in every city, total 12335 observations in 6 cities.
- Rural migrants: 600 households in every city, total 8094 observations in 6 cities.

### Defining formal versus informal sector

- Formal sector:
  - Government and public/civil administrative agencies
  - Businesses with more than 7 employees
- Informal sector:
  - Businesses with 7 or fewer employees

### Defining informal employment

- ILO recommends a job-based definition of informal employment.
- But, every country has its own special institutions and circumstances
- Key issue is how to define formal versus informal wage employment, here we adopt two alternative criteria:
  - Social insurance provision (best reflects international practice)
  - Labor contract (unique institutional importance in China)

### Informal employment definition

- Informal workers:
  - Family workers
  - Self-employed
  - Casual workers
- Formal workers:
  - Employees in government or public administrative agencies with official government-approved jobs (*bianzhi*), such workers have permanent employment and receive pension and health benefits
  - Employers of firms with more than 7 workers

# Informal employment definition (for employees not covered by previous categories)

 Definition 1 (social insurance): A worker who does not receive any of the three main types of mandated social insurance benefits (pension, health, and unemployment)

# Informal employment definition (for employees not covered by previous categories)

 Definition 2 (labor contract): A worker who lacks a formal labor contract. Labor contracts include fixed-term contracts, open-ended contracts, contracts for work completed, and contracts with labor service companies that assign workers to other employers.

### Categories of informal workers

- According to Definition 2, the following workers are defined as having informal jobs:
  - A. Unpaid family worker.
  - B. Self-employed worker.
  - C. Informal employees in formal sector, which include employees without formal contract and temporary workers.
  - D. Informal employees in informal sector.
  - E. Employers in informal sector (7 employees or less)

#### Combination definitions

- Definition 3: Informal employment based on either Definition 1 or Definition 2 (no social insurance or no labor contract)
- Definition 4: Informal employment based on both Definition 1 and Definition 2 (no social insurance and no labor contract)

### 3. Descriptive statistical results

- 1. There are significant differences in informal employment rate using different definitions.
- 2. There is a huge gap in informal employment between local residents and migrant workers; especially when it is calculated by definition 1. Because rural migrant workers still confront institutional obstacles in urban area, e.g., hukou system, city level coverage of pension system, etc.
- 3. Informal employment varies among different cities.

Table 1: informal employment by different definitions in cities

	•		~
un	1	••	U/_
			-//)

		Definition 1			Definition 2	
city	Full	Local	Migrant	full sample	Local	Migrant
	sample	resident			resident	
Shanghai	16.6	4.0	69.9	14.7	8.9	39.3
Wuhan	25.8	19.1	86.8	37.0	31.5	87.3
Shenyang	29.4	24.6	72.9	53.9	51.9	71.4
Fuzhou	32.7	24.0	64.5	35.2	29.0	57.9
Xi-an	30.0	26.2	76.3	35.8	33.2	66.2
Guangzhou	31.0	18.2	46.3	34.6	27.7	42.9
total	25.5	16.2	60.6	31.0	26.3	49.0

Table 1: continued

	Definition 3				Definition 4			
city	Full	Full Local Migrant		Full	Local	Migrant		
	sample	resident		sample	resident			
Shanghai	22.7	10.7	73.2	9.3	2.5	38.0		
Wuhan	39.1	33.3	91.4	23.2	16.7	82.2		
Shenyang	58.3	56.1	78.9	26.0	21.4	66.9		
Fuzhou	44.6	37.2	71.4	24.3	16.8	51.6		
Xi-an	41.0	37.7	80.0	25.3	22.1	63.3		
Guangzhou	41.2	31.5	52.8	25.7	15.0	38.6		
total	37.2	29.6	65.9	19.9	13.2	45.4		

Table 2: The distribution of different definition on informal employment

unit:%

	full samples		Local residen	t		Migrant	
		total	formal 2	informal	total	formal 2	informal
				2			2
formal 1		100	84.0	16.0	100	88.1	11.9
	(74.9)	(84.0)	(95.8)	(50.9)	(40.5)	(70.1)	(9.8)
informal 1		100	19.3	80.7	100	25.6	74.4
	(25.1)	(16.0)	(4.2)	(49.1)	(59.5)	(29.9)	(90.2)
total		100	73.6	26.4	100	50.9	49.1
	(100)	(100)	(100)	(100)	(100)	(100)	(100)

Table 3: Different types of employment

unit: %

	Local resident	Migrant	Total
Formal employment	83.9	39.5	74.6
Informal employee in	5.4	24.1	9.3
informal sector			
Informal employee in formal	5.2	12.1	6.6
sector			
Employer in informal sector	0.2	1.0	0.4
Self-employed	4.6	20.3	7.9
Unpaid family worker	0.8	3.0	1.3
Total	100	100	100

### Formal sector and formal job

Table 4: the employment distribution in sectors and jobs

unit:%

	Full sample	Loca	ocal resident workers Migrant workers			ers	
		Total	Total Formal Informal		Total	Formal	Informal
			jobs	jobs		jobs	jobs
Formal sector	77.9	84.1	94.8	54.1	54.4	71	37.3
Informal	21.3	15.1	5.1	43	44.5	28.9	60.6
sector							
Household	0.9	0.8	0.1	2.9	1.1	0.1	2.1
sector							
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

Note: Formal job defined by formal contract and decent work.

Table 5-1: informality in different industries

	• ,		$\sim$
un	11	•	U/_
			-//)
MII.	ıι	•	70

		Definition 1			Definition 2	
	Full	Local	Migrant	Full	Local	Migrant
	sample	resident		sample	resident	
Manufacturing	14.3	6.8	52.8	18.8	17.9	23.5
Other industries	17.9	9.3	57.5	24.3	19.3	46.8
Public services	8.6	5.9	37.8	9.6	8.4	22.2
Personal services	33.6	22.9	64.3	40.6	35.3	55.8
other	28.3	24.7	57.6	35.3	33.1	53.4
Total	25.4	16.0	60.6	30.9	26.1	49.1

Table 5-2: informality in different industries

unit:%

		Definition 3			Definition 4	
	Full	Local	Migrant	Full	Local	Migrant
	sample	resident		sample	resident	
Manufacturing	26.6	21.0	55.4	6.8	3.9	22.1
Other industries	31.1	23.8	64.9	12.4	5.6	43.7
Public services	13.0	10.2	41.6	5.1	3.9	17.9
Personal services	46.9	38.9	69.9	28.0	19.7	51.8
other	41.5	37.6	73.6	27.3	24.7	48.2
Total	37.0	29.4	66.0	19.9	13.1	45.4

## 4. A further analysis on informal employment

Table 6: info	Table 6: informality by age group and gender(definition 1)				unit:%			
Age group	Full	I	Local residen	t	Migrant			
	sample							
		Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
16-24	47.4	30.5	32.8	31.6	73.5	72.2	72.9	
25-34	26.4	19.7	13.7	16.8	55.4	53.2	54.3	
35-44	25.6	17.5	14.7	16	65.9	53.2	58.7	
45-54	18.5	16.9	11	13.1	72.4	63.4	67.1	
55-64	15.9	42.5	7.6	11.4	75.5	62.9	65.8	
Total	25.5	19.7	13.5	16.2	64	57.7	60.6	

Table 7: informality by age group and gender (definition 2)

Table 7: informality by age group and gender (definition 2)				inition 2)	unit: %			
Age group	Full	I	Local residen	t	Migrant			
	sample							
		Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
16-24	40.1	28.3	32.7	30.3	53	58.9	55.9	
25-34	24.5	20	17	18.5	42.4	40.9	41.6	
35-44	31.1	27.6	24.1	25.8	56.4	44.1	49.4	
45-54	36.0	39.7	29.8	33.4	67.2	54.6	59.8	
55-64	29.1	58.3	22.6	26.5	76.2	53.1	58.4	
Total	31.0	28.5	24.5	26.3	51.7	46.9	49.1	

Table 8: the wage of different employment groups in different cities unit: yuan

	Full	Local resident			Migrant		
	sample						
		Formal	Informal	informal/	Formal	Informal	informal/
		employme	employmen	formal	employme	employmen	formal
		nt		(%)	nt		(%)
Shanghai	2937	2965	1979	66.7	4475	2332	52.1
Wuahn	2117	2353	1274	54.2	2303	1779	77.2
Shenyang	1730	1836	1339	72.9	2385	1706	71.5
Fuzhou	2440	2602	2046	78.6	2767	2089	75.5
Xi-an	1731	1788	1517	84.9	2762	1636	59.2
Guangzhou	3615	3416	2705	79.2	5022	2819	56.1
Total	2625	2621	1725	65.8	4495	2336	52
Gini	0.39	0.36	0.39		0.41	0.33	
-coefficient							

Note: this is first definition.

Table 9: the wage of different employee in different city

	Full	Local resident			Migrant		
	sample						
		Formal	Informal	informal/	Formal	Informal	informal/
		employmen	employment	formal	employmen	employment	formal
		t		(%)	t		(%)
Shanghai	2822	2875	1755	61.1	4522	2231	49.3
Wuahn	2153	2302	1324	57.5	1744	1331	76.3
Shenyang	1647	1741	1258	72.2	2303	1582	68.7
Fuzhou	2311	2442	1993	81.6	2476	1902	76.8
Xi-an	1659	1731	1390	80.3	2205	1432	64.9
Guangzhou	2882	3150	2198	69.8	3183	2070	65
Total	2415	2514	1584	63	3283	2028	61.8
Gini	0.24	0.34	0.36		0.24	0.20	
-coefficient	0.34	U.3 <del>4</del>	0.30		0.34	0.29	

unit: yuan

Note: this is second definition.

Table 10-1: the working time of different employment (Definition 1)

Table 10-1: the working time of different employment (Definition 1)						unit: hour	
	full sample		Local resident			Migrant	
city		Formal	Informal	Total	Formal	Informal	Total
Shanghai	44.2	41.7	46.3	41.9	53.8	53.7	53.7
Wuahn	47.3	43.1	53.9	45.2	62.6	66.8	66.2
Shenyang	49.7	47.0	53.4	48.6	56.3	61.1	59.8
Fuzhou	47.5	43.5	51.3	45.4	49.7	58.4	55.3
Xi-an	48.8	45.0	54.7	47.5	61.2	63.9	63.3
Guangzhou	49.8	45.3	50.0	46.1	52.0	56.9	54.3
Total	47.3	43.6	52.4	45.0	52.9	57.7	55.8

Table 10-2: the working time of different employment (Definition 2)

Table 10-2: the working time of different employment (Definition 2)						unit: hour	
	Full sample		Local resident			Migrant	
city		Formal	Informal	Total	Formal	Informal	Total
Shanghai	44.2	41.6	45.5	41.9	49.2	60.8	53.7
Wuahn	47.3	42.1	52.0	45.2	54.0	68.0	66.2
Shenyang	49.7	45.5	51.4	48.6	55.1	61.7	59.8
Fuzhou	47.5	43.5	50.2	45.4	49.0	59.8	55.3
Xi-an	48.8	43.9	54.9	47.5	59.9	65.0	63.3
Guangzhou	49.8	44.7	50.0	46.1	52.2	57.1	54.3
Total	47.3	42.9	51.2	45.0	51.2	60.5	55.8

Table 11: working hour and years of schooling in different employment groups unit: hour, year

	V	Vorking hour		Years of schooling			
	local	migrant	total	local	migrant	total	
Formal employment	43.6	52.9	44.6	12.8	12.1	12.8	
Informal employee in informal sector	48.5	51.1	49.9	11.8	10.5	11.1	
Informal employee in formal sector	49.0	53.3	50.7	11.6	10.0	11.0	
Employer in informal sector	60.2	67.5	64.5	11.6	9.6	10.4	
Self-employed	59.9	66.5	63.4	10.5	9.0	9.7	
Unpaid family worker	55.4	64.3	59.8	9.5	8.1	8.8	
Total	45.0	55.8	47.3	12.6	10.7	12.2	

This is first definition.

Table 12: the working place of informal employment

unit: %

	local resident	Migrant	total
1 workshop, office, shop etc.	70.4	70.2	70.3
2 own home	7.2	5.0	6.1
3 employer home or customer home	4.5	7.2	5.8
4 farm or farmland	1.4	0.0	0.7
5 building site	1.3	2.8	2.0
6 outdoor place or street	14.2	13.5	13.9
7 other	1.0	1.3	1.2
Total	100	100	100

The first definition.

Table 13: social insurance coverage in different employment groups unit: %

		First definition					Second defintion					
	Pensi	ion 1	Pens	ion 2	Pens	ion 3	Pens	ion 1	Pens	ion 2	Pens	ion 3
	Fm	In-f	Fm	In-f	Fm	In-f	Fm	In-f	Fm	In-f	Fm	In-f
local	96.7	0	3.6	17.2	5.2	4.5	92.4	49.6	4.4	10.0	5.5	3.9
migrant	59.8	0	4.9	1.8	9.3	4.1	39.7	6.9	3.8	2.2	7.9	4.4
total	92.6	0	3.8	9.5	5.7	4.3	84.3	35.4	4.3	7.4	5.9	4.0
	Heal	lth 1	Hea	lth 2	Hea	lth 3	Hea	lth 1	Hea	lth 2	Heal	lth 3
local	92.3	0	3.6	31.2	9.3	6.9	89.0	45.6	4.7	17.7	10.0	5.9
migrant	54.8	0	3.9	3.0	13.4	7.2	36.8	5.8	3.4	3.2	12.4	6.8
total	88.2	0	3.7	17.1	9.8	7.1	81.0	32.4	4.5	12.9	10.4	6.2
	Unen	nploy				Unemploy						
local	64.6	0					66.3	20.3				
migrant	46.2	0					32.1	3.8				
total	62.6	0					61.0	14.8				

Table 14: The characteristics of workers who lived in the city long or short unit: % More than 10 Less than 10 years Full sample years 56.1 25.5 Informal employment(1) 18.8 Informal employment (2) 28.1 44.5 31.0 Pension coverage 72.3 29.7 66.3 Healthinsurance 69.1 27.5 63.3 Unemploymentinsurance 35.8 18.4 33.3 Localresident pension 5.5 2.5 5.1 Commercialpension 4.6 5.0 4.7 Localresident health insurance 10.3 5.1 9.6 Commercialhealth insurance 7.8 7.8 7.6

### 5. Conclusion and implication

- One of the most remarkable attributes of informal employment in urban China is the huge gap between local residents and migrants, especially and rural migrant. The gap is even bigger when using first definition.
- Economic development and rising wage can improve the stability and the decency of job, but rural migrants can not overcome the institutional obstacles( Hu Kou, Social insurance system) that restrict them to work in bad jobs and stop them from staying in urban areas in a long run.
- The rational rural migrants reject to make contribution to social insurance system because they have negative expectation to benefit from the contribution.

 Formal sectors have experienced a rapid growth and a shortage of labor force, it is a good opportunity to encourage enterprises in the sector executing labor contract law and make contribution to social insurance fund for their employees.

## Comments Please! Thanks!